



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 3, 2023 REPORT NO. HRB-23-041

HEARING DATE: November 16, 2023

SUBJECT: **ITEM #5 – Amelia and Clara Ives House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Christopher Bommarito & Yemisrach Beyene; represented by Landmark Historic Preservation

LOCATION: 1817 Dale Street, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3
APN 539-225-05-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Amelia and Clara Ives House located at 1817 Dale Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Amelia and Clara Ives House located at 1817 Dale Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1983 addition, 2016-2017 addition, and detached covered cabana, all built outside the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade; a combination of roof forms including flat and gabled; parapets with crenelated corner details; clay tile roof cover; stucco cladding with sand finish; arched front entry patio with a wooden door, and wood tripartite and double-hung windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is located on a rectangular lot in the South Park neighborhood of the Greater Golden Hill Community and is located one block outside the boundary of the designated South Park Historic District.

The property is located within the boundary of the 2016 Golden Hill Survey, but was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the Amelia and Clara Ives House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Amelia Ives and Clara B. Ives, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Landmark Historic Preservation which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#), as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The property was constructed in 1927 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style, featuring a generally rectangular floor plan. The one-story structure has a flat primary roof and parapets with crenelated corner details. A gable projection with Spanish roof tiles is present at the front elevation, containing a covered front entry. The property is sided with a sand stucco finish.

The west elevation is the primary elevation, featuring most of the character-defining features. The entry is detailed with an arched doorway with an original wooden door. The gable projection is further detailed with a tripartite cottage-style wood window grouping. A second set of tripartite wood windows is also present, located to the south of the entry. Multiple round tile attic vents are present on this elevation. A raised "torch" relief is present below the crenelated parapet detail at the corner of this elevation. The front of the lot contains a raised landscaped area retained by a masonry wall. The north (side) elevation contains a battered, stucco-finished chimney with ogee shoulders. The side elevations display single parapets, round tile attic vents, and wooden double-hung windows but are otherwise devoid of elaborated architectural features. Some vinyl and aluminum replacement windows are present in original openings toward the eastern portion of the north and south elevations. The rear elevation is defined by non-original additions remodeled or constructed in 2016-2017; this elevation includes a non-original shed roof with exposed rafters, new transom windows, and new sliding glass doors.

Modifications to the building include a 1983 rear addition and post-1991 vinyl window replacements, some of which were restored to original wooden double-hung sashes in 2022. In 2016, Heritage Preservation staff deemed a rehabilitation project consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards, including a rear/side addition and a remodel of the 1983 rear addition. The owner at the time also constructed a detached cabana in the rear yard. Undated changes to the property include painting the clay tile roof green, demolishing a detached garage, and constructing the driveway wood gate. Overall, these modifications do not significantly impair the integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling and the building retains integrity as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of

Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Colonial Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including an asymmetrical façade; a combination of roof forms including flat and gabled; parapets with crenelated corner details; tile roof cover; stucco cladding with sand finish; arched front entry patio with a wooden door, and wood tripartite and double hung windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The applicant's request for designation for the property located at 1817 Dale Street did not include information to support a determination under HRB Criterion D as the architect and builder could not be identified; therefore, staff has not made a determination regarding eligibility under Criterion D at this time. Eligibility under this criterion may be reevaluated at a future date pending the submittal of additional information and analysis.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Amelia and Clara Ives House located at 1817 Dale Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The designation excludes the 1983 addition, 2016-2017 addition, and detached covered cabana, all built outside the period of significance.



Alvin Lin
Assistant Planner
City Planning Department



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
City Planning Department

al/SS

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 11/16/2023

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/16/2023, to consider the historical designation of the **Amelia and Clara Ives House** (owned by Christopher Bommarito & Yemisrach Beyene, C/O Alice Anglim, 1817 Dale Street, San Diego, CA 92102) located at **1817 Dale Street, San Diego, CA 92102**, APN: **539-225-05-00**, further described as BLK 43 LOTS 7 & 8 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Amelia and Clara Ives House on the following findings:

The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade; a combination of roof forms including flat and gabled; parapets with crenelated corner details; clay tile roof cover; stucco cladding with sand finish; arched front entry patio with a wooden door, and wood tripartite and double-hung windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1983 addition, 2016-2017 addition, and detached covered cabana, all built outside the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
TIM HUTTER, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
ATTN: HRB SECRETARY
1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER **N/A**

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

1817 Dale Street, San Diego, CA 92102

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER **539-225-05-00**

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER **0**