



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 13, 2023 REPORT NO. HRB-23-006

HEARING DATE: January 26, 2023

SUBJECT: **ITEM #6 – Michael and Helen Donnelly House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Doug Carlone; represented by Urbana Preservation & Planning, LLC

LOCATION: 4190 Utah Street, North Park Community, Council District 3
APN 446-301-3400

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Michael and Helen Donnelly House located at 4190 Utah Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Michael and Helen Donnelly House located at 4190 Utah Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1931 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 2022 Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a moderately pitched roof topped with red terra-cotta tiles, smooth stucco exterior, stylized arched windows and doors, asymmetrical façade, limited eave overhanging with exposed rafter tails, stucco chimney, detailed wooden entry door and wood windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource consists of a single-story, single-family residence and ADU and is located on a corner lot in a mixed-use neighborhood of the North Park Community.

The property was located within the boundary of the [2016 North Park Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey](#), but was not identified in the survey because it was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the Michael and Helen Donnelly House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Michael and Helen Donnelly, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Urbana Preservation and Planning, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The property at 4190 Utah Street was constructed in 1931 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The single-story, single-family dwelling features an L-shaped asymmetrical façade which is slightly elevated above street level due to the stem wall construction. The gabled roof is moderately pitched with a slight eave overhanging and is topped with a red terra cotta tile roof with short, exposed square rafter tails. The exterior is clad in stucco. West of the entry arch is a large arched window with single paned glass centered on the "L" end of the front façade. Both the entry arch and the main window arch are framed by stylized grey quoins. A small porch area is recessed into the front façade. The main entry arch is enclosed by a wrought iron gate which provides access to the front porch. The porch entry is punctuated by a symmetrically placed square window with five light panes above a single light pane. The north portion of the front elevation features a stylized square Palladian window. A third double-hung window with three lights above and a single light below is at the corner of the frontal façade. This home has an original large, wooden front door with exposed bolt heads and stylized metal scroll details. The main entry arch is enclosed by a curved iron gate which provides access to the front porch.

Modifications to the property are minimal and include a 3.5-foot high stuccoed wall enclosing the front patio. After conducting a site visit, staff determined that the house was likely restuccoed at an unknown date; however, the current stucco texture is appropriate for the style. A detached garage which was original to the house was demolished and replaced with a two-story ADU in 2022. Overall, these modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship, or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

The Spanish Colonial Revival style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. Its vocabulary is influenced by Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic or Renaissance precedents. The style became popular after the Panama-California Exposition of 1915 and reached its height in the 1920's and early 1930's before rapidly declining in the 1940's. Identifying features include a low-pitched roof with little or no eave overhang, red tile roof covering, stucco exterior wall finishes, an asymmetrical façade and arches above doors and principle windows. Common decorative details are patterned tiles, carved stonework, large focal windows, wooden or iron window grilles, decorative vents and balconies.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Colonial Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a moderately pitched roof topped with red terra-cotta tiles, smooth stucco exterior, stylized arched windows and doors, asymmetrical façade, limited eave overhanging with exposed rafter tails, stucco chimney, detailed wooden entry door and wood windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Michael and Helen Donnelly House located at 4190 Utah Street be designated with a period of significance of 1931 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The designation excludes the 2022 ADU constructed outside of the period of significance.



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
Development Services Department

AW/SS

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 1/26/2023

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/26/2023, to consider the historical designation of the Michael and Helen Donnelly House (owned by Car;pme-Medina Trust 01-17-22, 4190 Utah Street, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **4190 Utah Street, San Diego, CA 92104**, APN: **446-301-34-00**, further described as BLK 152 LOTS 47&48 E 100FT in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Michael and Helen Donnelly House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1931 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a moderately pitched roof topped with red terra-cotta tiles, smooth stucco exterior, stylized arched windows and doors, asymmetrical façade, limited eave overhanging with exposed rafter tails, stucco chimney, detailed wooden entry door and wood windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 2022 Accessory Dwelling Unit.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
ATTN: HRB SECRETARY
1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER **N/A**

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

4190 Utah Street, San Diego, CA 92104

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER **446-301-34-00**

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER **0**